Make Live and Let Die: Why Creative People are not so Creative to Solve Social Problems?

Luisa Marques Barreto*

Abstract: This paper aims to discuss the idea of creative city that has been used in the city of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, and how the so-called creative class seems to be not able to propose alternatives for solving urban and housing problems. This research uses the Foucauldian genealogical method to demystify the discursive formations that validate ritualized utterances, as in the case of the use of creativity, and is based on the literature on economy, cities and creative people as well as newspaper articles and magazines from approximately 2010 up to now combining theoretical research and analysis of social events just as the way they are reported and disseminated in the media. We hope to highlight how creativity is increasingly used as a biopolitical strategy applied in cities, populations and urban plans, economics and subjectivities in a globalized context. The hypothesis is that the creative class, which is supposed to revitalize and transform the urban centers didn´t prove until now that your creativity can be applied in a direction of an urban revolution. In contrast, we intend to show as the main result of the research the growth of a movement that is becoming more and more strategic and coordinated to handle with urban questions, which we are going to call counter-dromologic, alluding to Paul Virilio (1996). They are trying to deal with the very mismatch between the economic changes and the speed of urban operations to countering their advance.

Key words: Creative Cities, Creative Economy, Post-Fordism, Biopolitics, Heritage, Dromology.

Introduction

This paper aims to discuss the uses of the term *creative* and *creativity* in the so-called creative cities[1] and how the seemingly subtle shift of names and expressions, for example, from local commerce to mall, from building to tower[2] exposes not only

---

1 Creative territories are defined in the Brazilian Creative Economy Plan as: neighborhoods, cities or regions with creative cultural potentials capable of promoting integral and sustainable development, combining preservation and promotion of their cultural and environmental values. "As metas do Plano Nacional de Cultura", Ministério da Cultura, accessed July 12, 2012, http://www2.cultura.gov.br/site/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/As-Metas-do-Plano-Nacional-de-Cultura.pdf.

2 This comment refers to a speech given by the mayor of São Paulo about the construction of two towers of 100 meters high and of an open commercial area, designated by him of "open mall", in a region of the city that is in dispute for nearly 40 years between public power, real estate sector and society. This is an important region for gathering several built heritage assets, among them, the *Teatro Oficina (Garage Theater), one of the most important theaters in the city.* Maria Carolina Maia, "Teatro Oficina: the tycoon v the theatre", *The Guardian*, November 29, 2017, https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2017/nov/29/teatro-oficina-theatre-sao-paulo-counterculture-silvio-santos.

---

* Luisa Barreto is a journalist with a Master and PhD in Communication and Semiotics at the Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo Brazil (PUC/SP), professor of the postgraduate course Klauss Vianna Technique (PUC/SP) and collaborator of the website Outras Palavras. E-mail: barreto.luisa@gmail.com.

GPR ID: 2464-9929_v04_i02_p029

a profound change of meaning, but the consolidation of new urban planning strategies involving the concept of creative city. In this process of changing terms, protection agencies to the historical, artistic and cultural heritage, traditionally strong in Brazil are changing their direction on behalf of the construction of tourist centers by weakening the asset protection laws especially in urban reforms marked by the principle of diffusion.[3]

In particular, the paper will focus on how urban planning in Brazil has linked a discourse of creativity, in no way creative – once the projects assume a hygienist and standardized aesthetics of international requirements, excluding aspects of the mestizo culture, typical of Brazil – with a program of extermination of the black population living in slums. I would like to deepen the gap between the so-called "creative" projects and the public interests, especially the interests of the low-income and poor populations as well.

Like many countries in the world, which in recent years have been taken over by the idea of *creative city*, Brazil has not lagged behind in this movement. Inspired by the Australian mappings[4] and British on creative industries,[5] an attempt was made in the early 2010s to develop a Brazilian creative economy with similar premises addressed specifically in the Australian policy. Fortunately, issues related to copyright and sharing network were relativized in Brazil, given the strength that the debate on free and creative commons culture had in the country. The creative industries, especially in the areas of audiovisual, games and fashion were driven by the Ministry of Culture. Creative cities also gained prominence, resulting in at least two forms of urban planning, such as the revitalization process initiated in Paraty, which focuses on the growth of tourism associated with cultural events, that is the case of the International Literary Festival of Paraty (FLIP)[6] which boosted tourism in the city since 2003.

Another way of urban planning that took shape under the sign of creative city are the urban diffusional reforms carried out in the port area in the capital city of Rio de Janeiro, which specifically have begun a process of urban and social sanitation and galloping gentrification. The construction of the *Museu do Amanhã* (Museum of Tomorrow) has become the symbol of this reform. In the case of the capital of Rio de Janeiro, specifically, the government program *Minha Casa Minha Vida* (*My Home My Life*), facing social housing, was associated with another historical process of removing slums and the populations living in them. The program aims to build sets of apartments financed at low cost and buyers are prevented from selling or leaving the property before the end of the payment. Strategic plans in the urban area define risk areas and areas of social

---

3   Paola Jacques Berenstein (org.), Territórios Urbanos e Políticas Culturais (Salvador: NAPE/PPG-AU/ FAUFBA, 2004).

4   "Creative Nation: Commonwealth Cultural Policy, October 1994", Pandora Australia's Web Archive, accessed August 11, 2016, http://pandora.nla.gov.au/pan/21336/20031011-0000/www.nla.gov.au/ creative.nation/contents.html.

5   "Creative Industries Mapping Documents 1998", Gov UK, accessed August 11, 2018. https://www.gov. uk/government/publications/creative-industries-mapping-documents-1998.

6   "Festa Literária Internacional de Paraty (FLIP)", accessed August 11, 2018, http://flip.org.br.

interest, where the favelas are, in order to legally justify the removal actions that consist of transferring the families in garbage trucks to the blocks of *Minha Casa Minha Vida*.

In contrast, activist groups, movements pro-affordable housing and artists have mobilized the population of the great Brazilian metropolises to claim what should be public in the empty and underused spaces in the city, fighting the advance of interests related to public and private initiative for construction of buildings and shopping centers. This leads us to strongly consider the advance of coordinated actions and resistance. The complexity of these two antagonistic movements, tanato and biopolitics,[7] demonstrates the growing interest in urban issues as a part of sustainability itself and of the so-called urban revolution,[8] since this concerns not only to economic, natural or physical resources but forms of life in the cities as well.

The article is organized in three parts: (1) an analysis of how the term creativity was being associated with urban reforms in an attempt to create tourist poles, for instance, in the case of increasing investments in areas protected by historical and cultural heritage as well as of aggressive urban reforms driven by real estate industry and public power that through Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) and Urban Operation Consortium (UOC) privatize areas clearly defined as Special Zones of Social Interest (ZEIS).[9] Rio de Janeiro is the Brazilian city that most illustrates both cases, since it has in its town center reminiscences of the Portuguese colonization, as it was the capital of the empire. In this article, I will discuss the case of the redevelopment project of the port region called *Porto Maravilha*. With regard to the urban reforms that do not fulfill the social function of property or patrimonial protection policies, we will analyze the case of the Silvio Santos Group (SS) onslaught for the construction of two residential towers with twenty-story each building in front of the *Teatro Oficina* (Garage Theater). The Theater is listed as a historical, cultural, artistic and architectural heritage of the state of São Paulo and is located in an area that should be protected from this kind of building type.

(2) starting from the hypothesis that the creative economy, understood as a concept and cultural policy, created in the Australian (1994) and British (1998) departments of culture - after that spread around the world - as a political-economic strategy to save capitalism from its irreversible economic crisis, namely post-Fordist and post-industrial,[10]

---

7 Biopolitics refers to the book *The Birth of Biopolitics* (2008b), in which Foucault exposes the paradigm shift in the political management of populations, in the sense of making them economically more efficient and politically more docile and *tanatopolitics*, a perspective defended by Agamben (1998, 2002, 2004, 2017) in dialogue with Foucault on the prevalence of death policies and the consolidation of the state of exception as an inherent key factor in politics.

8 Henri Lefebvre, *A Revolução Urbana* (Belo Horizonte: Ed. UFMG, 1999).

9 Delimited areas in the city for the housing of low-income populations.

10 By that we mean, the increasingly brutal split between the activity of the factory and the enterprise, that is, the idealization of brand, the strategies of communication, marketing, design, in a nutshell, the immaterial and intellectual work that, when overvalued in relation to the productive system, supports the precariousness of the service sector, the forms of independent art and work, and a whole range of professional activities which are not included in creative industries - the great contradiction of creative economy -, nor in the industry of tangible goods.

operates in the specific case of cities under the dromological key[11] and thanatopolitics.[12] That means, by force and speed, by privatizing areas of social interest. These market forces driven by governments and real estate capital also excludes and kills ceaselessly the black, indigenous and historically marginalized populations in Brazil. It is important to emphasize that these two operators are not exclusive to the Brazilian context, being the dispositif of power par excellence of urban reforms enshrined under the sign of creativity.

(3) A discussion on how different groups are gathering together to think inside out creative cities and to create strategies. Is it possible to establish social policies that favors social interests? Which groups are interested and are fighting for it? I mean by that, groups that are proposing another way of planning and governing the city space from other practices and utterances, for example, projects that give priority to housing policies and the production of communal areas. In utterances, the terms social and collective demonstrate the intention that inclusion would be the rudder that guides human and urban development. In other words, is it possible to think outside the current market logic?

With this paper I hope to clarify that the use of the term *creative* in urban reforms and cultural government plans serve to deepen the logic of financial capitalism, which operates through processes of exclusion, gentrification and adaptation to international standards that do not privilege diversity or different forms of insertion in the labor market (actions that could be considered creative), especially in the cultural sector, but also inclusion in a broadly way, being thus the great paradox of the acclaimed creative economy in the present day.

The Semiotics of Urban Planning

In order to draw attention to the transformation of words and utterances used through the meaning of creativity, we want to highlight that, without referring directly to its almost immediate sense - of capacity or human ability to create - the term carries within not so explicitly the paradox of sense that Deleuze spoke about.[13] When utterances embrace different meanings, in the case of creative uses, when the predominance of one aspect almost excludes its reverse side. At the same time as it refers to the sense of creation and as long as the term is being repeated - creative city, creative economy, creative class - it becomes an empty signifier.

> The strength of paradoxes is that they are not contradictory, but they make us witness the genesis of contradiction. The principle of contradiction applies to the real and the possible, but not to the impossible from which it derives, that is, to the paradoxes or rather to what the paradoxes represent.[14]

11 Paul Virilio, *Velocidade e Política (São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 1996)*.
12 Giorgio Agamben, *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life* (California: Stanford University Press-Stanford, 1998).
13 Gilles Deleuze, *Lógica do Sentido* (São Paulo: Perspectiva, 1974).
14 Ibid., 45.

Unlike *(post) colonialism, queer, gender studies, biopolitics*, among other buzzwords, creativity is something that has its meaning completely depleted by repetition. It no longer assumes the sense of creation, on the contrary, it is constantly associated with the neoliberal discourse in order to become an integral part of it. We can no longer see, except those who have already paid attention to the paradox, to its function and use. The risk of increasing invisibility that emerges in the affirmative discourse of the creativity of everything is no longer to perceive the dispositive of power and language tangled in the neoliberal conception of creativity.

UNESCO, an arm of the United Nations (ONU), which focuses on promoting education, science and culture in the world, is the institution that has been defining and leading strategies, plans and cultural policies in the field of creative economics. Officially, it can be said that UNESCO presents statements and new definitions, which are being incorporated into cultural and political agendas, such as the gradual replacement of culture by creativity. The UNESCO network of creative cities, established in 2004 with the purpose "to promote cooperation with and among cities that have identified creativity as a strategic factor for sustainable urban development" (UNESCO),[15] strengthening the usage of the new meaning given to creativity instead of culture. Creative cities being understood as also defined by Charles Landry, that is, the way in which: "cities can create the enabling conditions for people and organizations to think, plan and act with imagination to solve problems and develop opportunities."[16]

The institution emerged in the post-war period in 1946 to ensure peace and security in the world through the protection of the cultural heritage of humanity, that is, through protection policies of local cultural heritage, oral and written cultural traditions, popular festivals, environmental parks, archeological sites, river basins, neighborhoods, cities and regions expanded globally. Over the years, the notion of cultural heritage has been transformed into universal heritage or human heritage, that is, any manifestation or event considered as asset protection area or intangible heritage, whether architectural, material or immaterial, must be related to a network that raises it into the category of "universal heritage of humanity". Progressively, tangible and intangible heritage are merged into the notion of creative territory and creative industries become more and more integrated into urban planning and reforms.

Specifically in urban centers, the so-called creative class, a type of human capital involved in creating "meaningful new forms,"[17] that is, a kind of immaterial labor that goes

---

15 The cities inscribed on the UNESCO network of creative cities, according to the institution, have the common objective of "placing creativity and cultural industries at the heart of their development plans at the local level and cooperating actively at the international level". "Creative Cities Network", UNESCO, accessed August 11, 2018, https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home.

16 "Biography", Charles Landry, accessed March 23, 2017, http://charleslandry.com/about-charles-landry/biography/.

17 Richard Florida, "Cities and the Creative Class", *City & Community* 2, no.1 (March 2003): 6, https://creativeclass.com/rfcgdb/articles/4 Cities and the Creative Class.pdf.

from the production of contents and communication to the production of technologies, design and architecture and that cluster in the great urban centers of the main capitals of the world. What justifies such agglomeration, according to the author, are the attractions that these urban centers offer, which are based on the *3Ts* principle: such cities would be tolerant, with respect to cultural and gender differences; they would concentrate talented people with a high level of university degrees and, as a consequence, technological hubs focused on innovation and creation of startups. The incoherence of this theory - although Florida has tried to redeem himself in his most recent book[18] - lies in not considering cities and countries always marked by high levels of social inequality and public power negligence in the city management, as well as by only including people inserted in the "creative market", excluding independent artists and the service sector.

It is expected from the creative class that it has the creative power to transform the cities. The concept of creative city, before to be related to the idea of boosting the capacity of innovating or creating new meaningful forms, as Florida says, it is related to three key factors. The first is the context of economic, social and political crisis triggered by a set of changes in the way the productive system operates, from a model based on homogeneous and large-scale production of goods to a model whose core is the immaterial labor, industrial automation, the shrinkage of industrial parks or even their complete migration to other countries with cheap workforce – as a consequence, precarious work grows alarmingly. The second point is that the space left by industries not only transformed the space itself, with the increasing number of abandoned factories, industrial sheds, warehouses and working-class villages available for new uses, but also reshaped work relations. The third aspect concerns the change of perspective centered from a way of urban planning based on constructing physical infrastructures - buildings, hospitals, schools, transport systems - to a more comprehensive model that involves the idea of "living well".

> […] the focus on the physical has gone as far as it can. For example, we know that a road or telecom network on its own will not create the kinds of innovative milieux that encourage people to interact and participate, but rather that this depends on the capacity to build partnerships by bringing institutions like universities together with local firms to develop new products. We know that crime will be solved less by physical control and more by establishing a sense of place and mutual responsibilities in communities and neighbourhoods. We know that more sustainable environments will not be created if we only look at the environmental dimension; we also have to address how people mix and connect, their motivations and whether they take responsibility and 'own' where they live and change their lifestyles appropriately. To make cities respond to change we need to assess how 'feel', ambiance, atmosphere and 'soft' infrastructures are created, something which requires different skills from

---

18   Richard Florida, *The New Urban Crisis: how our cities are increasing inequality, deepening segregation, and failing the middle class - and what we can do about it* (London: Oneworld Publications, 2017), Kindle.

those of planners brought up to think in terms of physical solutions.[19]

These soft infrastructures which Landry and Bianchini are talking about are highly connected with the 3Ts principle, but especially with the technology sector and especially the development of startups and clusters. In Brazil, the idea of class or creative cluster is less tied to the technological and innovation sector than to the urban reforms themselves, with more or less protection of tangible or intangible heritage. The great example of a creative city project in Brazil started with the social hygiene program at the port area of Rio de Janeiro and, more recently, the revocation of the heritage-listed area surrounding Teatro Oficina (Garage Theater) in São Paulo are cases that illustrate the controversial relationship between patrimonial policies that are increasingly becoming obsolete, infringed, and the proliferation of creative territories. Successive barriers to the deployment of public parks, a recurring fact in Brazilian cities, is another important aspect of the discussion, since public space has been progressively privatized or modified in Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) and Urban Operation Consortium (UOC). Laws protecting areas of social interest have been strategically changed as in the case of the resolution that bars new asset protection area in the waterfront known as Porto Maravilha.

Porto Maravilha was reformed through an Urban Operation Consortium (UOC), an urban law instrument that allows the municipal government to grant private companies the right to build, renovate or re-urbanize particular areas in the city restricted to regular legislation of use and occupation of the soil. In other words, the right to build is extended to companies, giving them more and more power to intervene in the city, in the same measure that limits social interests and neglects Special Zones of Social Interest (ZEIS), undoes heritage-listed protection and reduces the capacity of social movements to act in time, slowing down the speed whereby such operations are carried out in the territory. Added to this the favelas removal program that strategically takes away families living in favelas near to the center, taken in garbage trucks, replace the implementation of urbanization projects focused on improving housing complexes and neighborhoods, infrastructure and so on by removals and social cleansing.

Inheritance of the Olympic Games, that took place in 2016 in Rio, the acclaimed revitalization of the port area became a land of abandoned construction works such as the popular housing project *Porto Vida Residencial* (*Port Residential Life*), which would be destined to municipal civil servants and which is only possible currently to see its bones structure.

In other words, the Urban Operation Consortium (UOC) favours the construction of a creative pole in the region with the installation of the *Museu do Amanhã* (Museum of Tomorrow), a monumental architectural work designed by the Spanish architect Santiago Calatrava and the MAR (Rio Art Museum), aside from the supposed recovering

---

19 Charles Landry and Franco Bianchini, *The Creative City* (London: Demos, 1995), 13-14.

and protection of historical heritage and buildings constructed during the Portuguese colonization. While the ZEIS are being strategically disregarded and the laws governing land use, planning and housing policies are constantly unauthorized.

The project to reform the port area of Rio de Janeiro was based on the necessity to create a city-brand able to be presented to the World Cup (2014) and Olympic Games (2016). The recovering of urban infrastructure comprising a new system for drinking water supply, sewage plant, drainage system of rainwater, public lighting, energy, telephony, piped gas and the implementation of the Light Rail Vehicle System (VLT) seems to be the best reform plan.

At first there seems to be nothing wrong with the redevelopment plan for the area, unless we don´t look at how reforms are implemented. When they are taken as "creative reforms", the positive aspect that the term carries would lead to invisibility the problem of favelas removals and forced displacement of former residents, as well as the overshadowed social cleansing and urban gentrification program - if it were not for the work of associations and non-governmental organizations to struggle for the survival of populations living in there. Added to this, the erasing process of historical and immaterial heritage with the implementation of monumental architectural projects as in the case of museums and restoration of facades.

A similar case arises in São Paulo capital. In this case, there is no sea, no port, but the attempt to requalify the city center, as shown by the projects *Nova Luz* (New Light), *Arco do Futuro* (Arc of Future) and most recently, in full dispute between public power, companies and society, the region of Bixiga where the *Teatro Oficina* is located. The Bixiga neighborhood, hitherto known as the Italian neighborhood of São Paulo circumscribes a striking class division in the district of Bela Vista. The famous Bixiga is actually an Afro-Italian neighborhood,[20] marked by the presence of black population and Italian immigrants who came to Brazil between the 19th and 20th centuries, a typical Brazilian amalgam, despite the great attempt to erase the black roots of the neighborhood and now its past and historical, artistic and cultural present.

On May 25th 2018, the Institute of Historical and Artistic Heritage (IPHAN) together with the Council for Defense of Historical, Archaeological, Artistic and Tourist Heritage (CONDEPHAAT), took another measure of revocation of immaterial and historical heritage. The possibility of revoking a historical asset heritage-listed - despite the contradiction of this phrase - is a political measure usually carried out by decree, with the purpose of building in some part of the city considered area of patrimonial preservation. This juridical-political resource was established by the former President Getúlio Vargas (1883-1954) through the Decree-Law 3.866 of 1941 in order to build one of the largest avenues in Rio de Janeiro, *Avenida Presidente Vargas*, constructed at the time as a re-urbanization project on the northern side of the city and to receive civic and military

---

20 Márcio Sampaio de Castro, *Bexiga: um bairro afro-italiano* (São Paulo: Annablume, 2008).

parades. The urban reform could only be done as *Campo de Santana*, a garden opened in 1873 was taken out of the heritage list, as well as the Baroque church of *São Pedro dos Clérigos* (St. Peter of Clerics), built in 1733.

What does this mean? In some cases, the decrease of part of the territory to accommodate other construction works, as in the case of the revocation of the heritage-listed area of *Campo de Santana* or the complete breakdown of the building, as in the case of the *São Pedro dos Clérigos* Church, which was completely destroyed. There is also a third case, that is, the revocation of a patrimonial area inscribed on the historical heritage list, to be carried out a new construction work that clearly de-characterizes regions protected by a "cone of protection". In general, this type of invalidation is the result of a negotiation between public power and private interests, in which the private interest overcomes the public interest. This is the case of *Teatro Oficina*, one of the most important theaters in São Paulo, whose architectural design was made by Lina Bo Bardi, who also planned the *Museu de Arte de São Paulo* (MASP) and the *Sesc Pompeia* building, was conceived to compose with the landscape and its surroundings. That means, interior and exterior are in permanent state of communication.

Zé Celso, the main figure and members of the theater launched on October 26th, 2017 the *#VETAasTORRES Manifesto* (vetting the towers) together with friends of the theater, not only for its captive audience, but for the surroundings, for the neighborhood and for the city. For this city that still has a few hollow spaces and still accommodates some emptiness in its center. The manifest says:

> We do not want to build buildings, we desire the poetics of emptiness as a construction, in an exercise of imagination, creating pockets of breath in the urban fabric of São Paulo, allowing the land to remain green, permeable to light, rain and time. A space for circuses; shows; outdoor shows performed by different theater companies; music; visual arts; cinema in temporary, ephemeral installations in direct contact with nature.[21]

The proposal of the SS Group, which won the right to build along with the city hall of São Paulo, was to build an "open-air mall" with mixed buildings, commercial and residential towers. Finally, the Group, whose owner is a television presenter of one of the largest communication companies in Brazil, who also holds the ownership of the vacant land next to the theater, opted to build up two residential towers with over a hundred meters high, with the endorsement of the National Historical and Artistic Heritage Institute (IPHAN).

These cases illustrate the imminent risk to the cities when governing authorities and enterprises settle to lead megalomaniac projects, such as this one presented by the SS Group, but also urban reforms that, at first, claim the necessity of structural reform or

---

21 "MOVIMENTO #VETAASTORRES", Teatro Oficina, accessed August 11, 2018, http://teatroficina. com.br/movimento-vetaastorres-ficaoficina/.

revitalization, but which end up de-characterizing the city, erasing its history, removing low-income populations from the center, all this in the name of raising creative poles and a strong center that represents a city-brand. We need to ask ourselves about this discourse and practice, which are advancing around the world and which effects they entail in the long term.

The Creative Dromological City and its Topology

Milton Santos considered space an instance of society, in the sense of being a set of factors, values and functions that constitute a certain social scope, such as culture and economy. In the words of Santos: space "*contains* and *is contained* by other instances, just as each of them contains and is contained by it. The economy *is* in the space, just as space *is* in the economy."[22] Space is not formed only by things and objects, there are the geographical and spatial domain and a certain arrangement of objects in the landscape being activated by social processes which are materialized in forms. "That's why space contains the other instances. It is also contained in them, insofar as specific processes include space, whether the economic process, the institutional process or the ideological process."[23]

According to Santos, space is also a totality that can be analyzed from the composition of its parts: men, firms, institutions, infrastructures and ecological environment. Each of the space elements is interchangeable: "men can also be taken as firms or as institutions (in the case of citizens, for example), in the same way as institutions act as firms and these as institutions."[24] In the latter case, Santos gives the example of transnationals and large corporations, when they create certain social norms by extrapolating their internal limits and competing with the state, as it happens with the establishment of commodity prices by big monopolies. Given the interaction between the elements of space, it can only be understood as a complex system of structures, as a network of relations.[25]

In this network, some specific areas are particularly developed in creative cities. Tourism is one of them as well as many types of re-urbanization reforms. The creative city, understood as a new planning paradigm for cities, embrace and refine the logic of stimulating insofar it retains people flows by, at the same time, boosting tourism or improving the transport system in specific areas and hampering the circulation of certain populations. The logistic production of space, effectively produced by engineers or architects, but actually thought and planned by governing authorities and businessmen match with the birth of biopolitics, with the art of calculating and measuring space by relating these data to the production of statistics on populations as well as to dromology.

---

22 Milton Santos, *Espaço e Método* (São Paulo: Edusp, 2008), 12.
23 Ibid.
24 Ibid., 17.
25 Ibid., 28.

According to Berenstein,[26] there are two dominant tendencies today, a predisposition to set "freezing policies", which combine patrimonial policies and tourism boost that transforms urban centers into "city-museums" and "theme-park-cities" and a tendency that goes in the opposite direction, which is focused on "diffusion policies", that means, rampant building in areas already highly populated or the rapid expansion of the urban fringes. Both inclinations lead to what she calls the spectacularization of cities, but they are also related to the logic of speed. The executors of these projects, whether of freezing or diffusion are generally the same and they are used to promote the same market dynamics.

To better explore the logic of speed, Virilio suggests a shift from topology to what he calls dromology or the government of mobility to the analysis of how cities are planned. According to Paul Virilio:

> The whole world is aware that there is a political economy of wealth. Power is linked to wealth. But people forget to say that wealth is linked to speed. In the Greco-Latin era, the bankers were knights or navigators. The surplus value was linked to the speed of ships in the Mediterranean - reread Fernand Braudel - or to the speed of the knights, those who carried the messages by carrying orders. When one says that time is money, it is meant to say that speed is power. Since the 1960s, I have been interested in this science - it is not science yet, but it might become one -, which I would call dromology.[27]

Dromology is also an epistemology that walks along with the urban revolution[28] as a counter-speed. Virilio suggests that this "science" has not been sufficiently developed, the same is possible to say about the urban counter-speed revolution. Dromology, that is to say, the study of speed or the logic of race,[29] of the political meaning of dromos, the Greek word for race in the constitution of cities also pervades the idea of creative city, but that perspective must also be developed in the sense of connecting a technique of power, as old as the speed, with the reality of the cities in transformation nowadays. Speed, understood here at the same time as a category of analysis of the society modernization process and technique of controlling the movement of things, people and information.

> Speed made history in the same way as wealth. It is not possible to separate them. Of course, there is also the speed of transmission: the telegraph, telephone, the wireless telegraphy, the radio, television and now the Internet. The speed of transport has been overtaken by an absolute speed of electromagnetic waves, which enable tele-communications, telework, the teleactivity and also the strategy.[30]

26 Paola Jacques Berenstein (org.), *Territórios Urbanos e Políticas Culturais* (Salvador: NAPE/PPG-AU/FAUFBA, 2004).

27 Paul Virilio, "Velocidade e Acidente Integral – entrevista de Paul Virilio", interview by Fernando Eichenberg, *Acervo Claudio Ulpiano*, April 24, 2018, https://acervoclaudioulpiano.com/2018/04/24/velocidade-e-acidente-integral-entrevista-de-paul-virilio/.

28 Henri Lefebvre, *A Revolução Urbana* (Belo Horizonte: Ed. UFMG, 1999).

29 Virilio, *Velocidade e Política, 53.*

30 Paul Virilio, "Velocidade e Acidente Integral – entrevista de Paul Virilio", interview by Fernando Eichenberg, *Acervo Claudio Ulpiano*, April 24, 2018, https://acervoclaudioulpiano.com/2018/04/24/

This strategy to which the author refers is exactly the political strategy of domination by land tenure. Peter Hall[31] defends a similar thesis as Lefebvre's and very close to Virilio's, apparently quite widespread among architects and urbanists, that the urban planning of the twentieth century would be a reaction to the problems that emerged in the nineteenth-century cities, and therfore we handle now the heritage of the industrial mode of planning from the twentieth´s.

According to Lefebvre, each city is constituted and differentiated by its social and production relations. The urban society would be the result of an expansion of urbanization, as a process that stems from industrialization, from the industrial city, as far as it dominates and absorbs agricultural production until it reaches the point of its almost dissolution. This occurs when agriculture becomes a specific sector among industrial sectors and as a final result "of a process in the course of which old urban forms explode, inherited from discontinuous transformations."[32] These old forms, characteristic of former city models, need to undermine themselves to give rise to new arrangements. Urban society, in that it is born of industrialization and succeeds it, leads off the post-industrial society. This means that the post-industrial creative city, in an attempt to handle the problems of the industrial city would also involve the capacity of transforming it through another regime of utterances and practices. Lefebvre named that urban revolution, this process whereby the knowledge about urbanization would culminate in an urban practice to be "re-learn", apart from urbanism as a science of the urban, that is, this transformation would be made less by experts and more by the need to create common spaces and new forms of social interaction.

Virilio, in *Speed and Politics*, referred to circulation as something paradoxical in any revolution. Revolution as a univocal idea, at the same time, in a sense close to Lefebvre's, when considering the urban revolution, a virtual and possible stage of the development of cities (and subjectivities), demonstration, disorder, conquest of the street. And revolution in the sense of "assault machine", when certain social or political class "changes the rules of the game", stands out, turns the current reality by force or, as Virilio would say, by speed, by time gained – as in the French Revolution. The city simultaneously ideal fixed point, place to stop for the migratory flows and surveillance platform with its tollgates and customs office surrounded by inaccurate places that control movement:

> The ancient swampy and unhealthy beaches surrounding the fortified city, the *congo-plains* of the American slave, the old fortifications, the poor peripheries and slums, but also the mental hospital, the barracks and the prison, solve more a problem of flow than of enclosure or exclusion. They are all inaccurate places because, between two transit of speeds, they act as brakes of penetration, of its acceleration. Located

   velocidade-e-acidente-integral-entrevista-de-paul-virilio/.

31 Peter Hall, *Cidades do Amanhã: uma história intelectual do planejamento e do projeto urbanos do século XX* (São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2013).

32 Lefebvre, *A Revolução Urbana*, 13.

from the origin in the terrestrial or fluvial communication routes, they are later com-
pared to sewers, to standing water. The interruption of the flow (of progress), the
sudden absence of motricity creates, ineluctably, an almost organic corruption of the
masses.[33]

These inaccurate places that give rise to the suburbs and lodgings, not to the right
to the city, are encapsulated in a great dispositive of power, as Foucault also referred
to,[34] which includes strategies of movement control, daily security practices at borders
and customs, monitoring by surveillance cameras and, last but not least, by the real
estate power. According to Virilio, the bourgeoisie exercised its power much more by
the property of a "fixed abode" with a monetary and social value that guaranteed a place
inside the protected city, than by trade or infant industry.[35]

In the post-industrial reality which we are living in, another way of planning needs to be
reconsidered especially by redirecting investments in social housing and communal areas
such as parks, public squares, cultural facilities, open-air cinema; in protecting informal
trade, in the case of Brazilian reality, all this in association with a welcome program for
families living in social exclusion. That would not only be a way of protecting urban
centers from degradation processes that afterward justify "revitalization" programs and
reforms, but a follow-up work of dealing with the reality of the city. A starting point to
an urban revolution in the sense given by Lefebvre and Virilio – as a virtual and possible
stage to the development of cities. To revitalize, in this perspective, it means generating
investments that might be conducted by the inhabitants, facilitating their integration,
circulation and the right to the city. This perspective I am appointing here as counter-
speed.

Inside out Creative Cities

On the other side of this creative-city-friendly tendency there are a range of counter-
actions that challenge this hegemonic tendency of the market, I dare say, in a creative and
creating way, insofar as they depart from a broader and more complex notion of city, social
and intercultural coexistence, they act in favor of creating green areas and in protection
of poor and endangered populations, among other initiatives. However, because they do
not have the support of the public power, but rather of part of the engaged population,
their actions do not constitute themselves as real government plans or public policies, nor
do they have their demands taken into account. Proposals are treated with mockery and
disdain.

Besides that, socially active groups have been reinforcing each other in an attempt to
consolidate their proposals and bringing it to the public management. They fight, inter

---

33 Virilio, *Velocidade e Política, 23.*
34 Michel Foucault, *Segurança, Território, População* (São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008a).
35 Virilio, *Velocidade e Política, 24.*

alia, against the daily *let them die* or to the zones of production of death. This topic is essential in the analytic of creative cities, because albeit being old in the philosophical and political debate crossing the concepts and the theories of state, of power, totalitarianism and sovereignty, we are still in search of extending the relation between something contemporary as the concept of creativity, as it is used in politics, and that of biopolitics. By deepening this gap and returning centuries back, we know that the ground of the Greek polis was already conceived from its original crack between those who have the right to expression and to the city and those who do not. The point on biopolitical theory remains in the blind spot that Agamben referred to:

> The present inquiry concerns precisely this hidden point of intersection between the juridico- institutional and the biopolitical models of power. What this work has had to record among its likely conclusions is precisely that the two analyses cannot be separated, and that the inclusion of bare life in the political realm constitutes the original – if concealed – nucleus of sovereign power. *It can even be said that the production of a biopolitical body is the original activity of sovereign power.* In this sense, biopolitics is at least as old as the sovereign exception. Placing biological life at the center of its calculations, the modern State therefore does nothing other than bring to light the secret tie uniting power and bare life, thereby reaffirming the bond (derived from a tenacious correspondence between the modern and the archaic which one encounters in the most diverse spheres) between modern power and the most immemorial of the *arcana imperii*.[36]

This perspective is clearly different from the Foucauldian point of view as far as for him biopolitics is a modern advent whereby life has begun to be included in the calculations of state. Agamben, in turn, by seeing this inclusion of natural life - or bare life - at the core of politics as a continuation since the Greek polis shed light on this key aspect of how exclusion and state of exception pervade the life in cities hitherto and I would add as well as the logic of speed. Several people have already paid attention to both paradoxes and they are acting coordinated in order to stem the ravenous appetite by which the estate capital market tries to deepen the crack.

he counter-dromologic movement being understood here not necessarily as a deceleration movement, although it involves this category, but as an "act in time" to prevent urban reforms and the revocation agreements of asset areas, among other interventions, is growing increasingly up, albeit in another time of acting in comparison with the real estate market, but enough sufficiently for the moment to create a subjective impact on social movements. To act in due time involves a strategic plan that encompasses several aspects like mapping the zones of social interests where populations are being constantly attacked, encouraging mobilizations and gathering together, creating new technologies of communication, among others. This movement operates differently to the engine of

---

36 Agamben, *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*, 11.

the rise of the creative class especially for having as main driving force the struggle for common and democratized spaces - the opposite of creative clustering.

In general, these counter-hegemonic movements consist of collectives - institutions, individuals, theater groups, non-governmental organizations, academic research groups - that seek to organize themselves in coordinated actions with other collectives acting on similar fronts. A good example is the *Fórum Aberto Mundaréu da Luz,*[37] which defines itself as a "collective that proposes alternatives with the population" and that has been proposing alternatives to stop another unilateral process of real estate expansion in the region of Luz, São Paulo´s downtown, which has been in dispute for years. Expansion, in this sense, means the "expansion of real estate capital and its products: cultural centers, residential middle-class condominiums, corporate towers."[38]

They are proposing alternative projects to the city hall in two strategic areas defined as Special Zones of Social Interest in the center of São Paulo that harbors *Cracolândia*, the homeless population with highly index of drugs consumption inhabiting the region of *Luz* and *Campos Elíseos*. Architects and designers, one of the different tasks of the group members, are planning and presenting solid projects of how a policy of welcoming this populations combined with investments in affordable housing scheme, communal areas and cultural activities can transform São Paulo's downtown.

Coming back to the initial problem of this article on the uses of the terms *creative* and *creativity*: why still cultural has a different meaning compared to creative and why the uses of "social", "communal spaces", "social rent", "accessible restaurant", among other expressions, are more inclusive than saying "creative"? The foreword of the revised text of the Creative Industries Mapping Document published in 2001 by the British Department of Digital, Culture, Media & Sport (DCMS) answers the question:

> In revisiting the *Creative Industries Mapping Document* we have retained the orig-
> inal definition of the creative industries as "*those industries which have their origin
> in individual creativity, skill and talent and which have a potential for wealth and job
> creation through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property.*"[39]

37 The *Mundaréu da Luz Open Forum* is a collective that brings together institutions, groups and people committed to proposing alternatives to the Luz region, such as the Citizenship Action; Mungunzá Theater Company; Craco Resists; Citizenship and Human Rights (NECDH), Rights of the Elderly and the Person with Disabilities (Nediped); FLM - Fight Front for Housing; State Front of Antimanicomial Fight (Feasp-SP); IAB-SP - Institute of Architects of Brazil/São Paulo; INNPD - Black Initiative for New Drug Policy; Pólis Institute; LabCidade - Public Space Laboratory and Right to the City/FAUUSP; LabJUTA - Territorial Justice Laboratory/UFABC; LEVV - Laboratory of Violence and Social Vulnerability Studies/Mackenzie University; Residents and merchants of blocks 36, 37 and 38 of Campos Elíseos district; Observatory of Removals; REPEP - Patrimonial Educational Paulista Network; UHM - Union of Housing Movements, among others. "Sobre o Fórum", Fórum Aberto Mundaréu da Luz, accessed August 11, 2018, https://mundareudaluz.org/sobre-o-forum/.
38 "Dossiê Luz", Fórum Aberto Mundaréu da Luz, accessed August 11, 2018, https://mundareudaluz.org/2018/03/14/sobre-o-processo/.
39 "Secretary of State's Foreword", GOV. UK, accessed January 15, 2002, https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/183544/2001part1-foreword2001.pdf.

To think inside out the creative city requires a perspective shift from cultural policies focused only in developing creative industries poles and regional city-brands as well as revitalization processes anchored in tourism development to affordable housing policies, which are much more interesting for cities from the point of view of the maintenance of its historical center, commercial zones and populations. A strategy based on recovering damaged buildings, including the preservation of tangible heritage so that it serves on the conservation of public spaces, leisure areas and social inclusion is much more effective in the long term than development policies based on creation of tourist centers or creative poles. Tourism is contingent, it floats and oscillates in waves of interest that are directed and redirected to different cities and contexts all the time, it is neither by far nor nearly the smartest strategy of thinking the natural advance of social transformations in space.

In conclusion, to think outside the creative city within the dromological key means to become aware and to counteract by improving strategies that go in the opposite path. Like Virilio said: [...] "Policy of progress and change are empty words if one does not see behind the electric megalopolis, behind the city that doesn´t stop, the dark silhouette of the old fortress fighting against its inertia and for those who stop means to die".[40] Not being able to stop is the logic that guides the suffocation of *Teatro Oficina* and the denial of the right to preserve empty lots and to transform them into parks. Park for what?

To stop.

Final Considerations

Creative city is a concept difficult to define, as well as creative economy. Both were formulated differently in the countries that originated them and in the countries that absorbed them. That was not different in Brazil, where the necessity to say that we would produce not only a different concept, but the creation of policies that would promote the Brazilian culture in its various aspects and cultural features born with the indigenous and African people were especially strong. But the ordinary conception of culture as a distinctive element of a people or country was confused with the idea of creativity, giving to it a simple economic sense and to culture something related to the promotion of cultural diversity, sustainability and social inclusion. Creativity seemed to correspond to the GDP and culture to something that improves life in general and that needs to be somehow fostered. The idea of a creative city was conceived in Brazil within this ambiguity.

Creative city is nothing less than a concept, one can say that this concept doesn´t matter, that no one lives the reality of the city as a creative city, but this is a concept whose meaning becomes effective every time that the creative class are glorified by transforming neighborhoods and local economy through their own bodies. A body that is the capital itself. A body that is clustered in certain urban centers and precisely because of that triggers gentrification, exclusion and sanitation processes. If power relations pass through

---

40 Virilio, *Velocidade e Política, 28.*

the body and are produced by it, how could this process be stopped? Who has this power?

I raised the problem of changing names to underline that to change the city is also to change their utterances, by substituting terms that affects and are affected by the urban planning in order to strengthen the construction of city brands based on this idea of creative city that comes stimulating at least two decades after the so-called urban revitalizations in a very questionable way, mainly in the developing countries, as is the case of Brazil. The urban centers are sold out, drained by urban reforms without planning them with people living in its centers where and how they want to live. No one knows where to put the refugees and the huge mass of precarious workers growing every day, just to point out emerging and urgent problems that require a creative skill. Interestingly, the creative class cannot find a solution to this type of problem. The creative class is nothing more than a variation of human capital, a capital that calls itself creative but cannot "think, plan and act with imagination to solve problems and develop opportunities", reversing Landry's words.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Agamben, Giorgio. *Estado de Exceção*. São Paulo: Boitempo, 2004.

Agamben, Giorgio. *Homo Sacer: o poder soberano e a vida nua*. Belo Horizonte: Editora UFMG, 2002.

Agamben, Giorgio. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. California: Stanford University Press-Stanford, 1998.

Agamben, Giorgio. *O Uso dos Corpos*. São Paulo: Boitempo, 2017.

Banerjee, Subhabrata Bobby. "Necrocapitalism". *City Research Online* 29 no.12 (May 2008): 1541-1563. http://openaccess.city.ac.uk/6088/1/Necrocapitalism_OS2008FINAL2.pdf.

Berenstein, Paola Jacques (org.). *Territórios Urbanos e Políticas Culturais*. Salvador: NAPE/ PPG-AU/FAUFBA, 2004.

Cocco, Giuseppe, and Sarita Albagli. *Revolução 2.0: e a crise do capitalismo global*. Rio de Janeiro: Garamond, 2012.

Cocco, Giuseppe. *Korpobraz: por uma política dos corpos*. Rio de Janeiro: Mauad X, 2014.

De Castro, Márcio Sampaio. *Bexiga: um bairro afro-italiano*. São Paulo: Annablume, 2008.

Deleuze, Gilles. *Lógica do Sentido*. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 1974.

Esposito, Roberto. *Bios: biopolítica e filosofia*. Portugal: Edições 70, 2010.

Florida, Richard, Charlotta Mellander, and Karen King. "Building 65 Million Jobs: the geography of low-paid service class jobs and how to begin to upgrade them". Toronto: Martin Prosperity Institute, 2017. http://martinprosperity.org/media/Building-65-Million-Good-Jobs.pdf.

Florida, Richard. "Cities and the Creative Class". *City & Community* 2, no.1 (March 2003): 3-19. https://creativeclass.com/rfcgdb/articles/4 Cities and the Creative Class.pdf.

Florida, Richard. *Cities and the Creative Class*. London: Routledge, 2004.

Florida, Richard. *The Flight of the Creative Class:* the new global competition for talent. New York: HarperBusiness, 2005.

Florida, Richard. *The New Urban Crisis: how our cities are increasing inequality, deepening segregation, and failing the middle class - and what we can do about it*. London: Oneworld Publications, 2017. Kindle.

Florida, Richard. *The Rise of the Creative Class*. New York: Basic Books, 2012.

Fórum Aberto Mundaréu da Luz. "Dossiê Luz". Accessed August 11, 2018. https://mundareudaluz.org/2018/03/14/sobre-o-processo/.

Fórum Aberto Mundaréu da Luz. "Sobre o Fórum". Accessed August 11, 2018. https://mundareudaluz.org/sobre-o-forum/.

Foucault, Michel. *Nascimento da Biopolítica*. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008b.

Foucault, Michel. *Segurança, Território, População*. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008a.

Gielen, Pascal. *Creativity and other Fundamentalisms*. California: Ram Publications, 2013.

Gov UK. "Creative Industries Mapping Documents 1998". Accessed August 11, 2018.

GOV. UK. "Secretary of State's Foreword". Accessed January 15, 2002. https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/183544/2001part1-foreword2001.pdf.

Guattari, Félix, and Suely Rolnik. "Cultura: um conceito reacionário?". In *Micropolítica: cartografias do desejo*. Petrópolis: Vozes, 1999.

Hall, Peter. *Cidades do Amanhã: uma história intelectual do planejamento e do projeto urbanos do século XX*. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2013.

Hartley, John. *Creative Industries*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005.

Howkins, John. *The Creative Economy: How people make money from ideas*. London: Penguin Press, 2001.

https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/creative-industries-mapping-documents-1998.

Landry, Charles and Franco Bianchini. *The Creative City*. London: Demos, 1995.

Landry, Charles. "Biography". Accessed March 23, 2017. http://charleslandry.com/about-charles-landry/biography/.

Landry, Charles. *The creative city: a toolkit for urban innovators*. Londres: Comedia, 2008.

Lazzarato, Maurizio. "Construction of Cultural Labour Market". *EIPCP* (Novembre 2006). http://eipcp.net/policies/cci/lazzarato/en.

Lazzarato, Maurizio. *The Making of the Indebted Man:* an essay on the neoliberal condition. Los Angeles: Semiotext(e), 2012.

Lefebvre, Henri. *A Revolução Urbana*. Belo Horizonte: Ed. UFMG, 1999.

Lefebvre, Henri. *O Direito à Cidade*. São Paulo: Centauro, 2001.

Lemke, Thomas. *Biopolitics: an advanced introduction*. New York: New York University, 2011.

Maia, Maria Carolina. "Teatro Oficina: the tycoon v the theatre". *The Guardian*, November 29, 2017. https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2017/nov/29/teatro-oficina-theatre-sao-paulo-counterculture-silvio-santos.

Mbembe, Achille. *Crítica da Razão Negra*. São Paulo: n-1 Edições. 2018.

Ministério da Cultura (MINC). "As metas do Plano Nacional de Cultura". Accessed July 12, 2012. http://www2.cultura.gov.br/site/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/As-Metas-do-Plano-Nacional-de-Cultura.pdf.

Ministério Da Cultura (MINC). "Plano da Secretaria da Economia Criativa: políticas, diretrizes e ações de 2011 a 2014". Accessed July 12, 2012. http://www.cultura.gov.br/documents/10913/636523/PLANO+DA+SECRETARIA+DA+ECONOMIA+CRIATIVA/81dd57b6-e43b-43ec-93cf-2a29be1dd071.

Pandora Australia's Web Archive. "Creative Nation: Commonwealth Cultural Policy, October 1994". Accessed August 11, 2016. http://pandora.nla.gov.au/pan/21336/20031011-0000/www.nla.gov.au/creative.nation/contents.html.

Pasquinelli, Matteo. "Creative Sabotage in the Factory of Culture: art, gentrification and the metropolis". In Animal Spirits: a bestiary of the commons. Amsterdam: NAi Publishers, 2008.

Rosler, Martha. "Culture Class: Art, Creativity, Urbanism, Part I". e-flux journal 21 (December 2010). http://www.e-flux.com/journal/21/67676/culture-class-art-creativity-urbanism-part-i/.

Santos, Milton. Espaço e Método. São Paulo: Edusp, 2008.

Teatro Oficina. "MOVIMENTO #VETAASTORRES". Accessed August 11, 2018. http://teatroficina.com.br/movimento-vetaastorres-ficaoficina/.

UNESCO. "Creative Cities Network". Accessed August 11, 2018. https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home.

Virilio, Paul. "Velocidade e Acidente Integral – entrevista de Paul Virilio". Interview by Fernando Eichenberg. Acervo Claudio Ulpiano, April 24, 2018, https://acervoclaudioulpiano.com/2018/04/24/velocidade-e-acidente-integral-entrevista-de-paul-virilio/.

Virilio, Paul. *Velocidade e Política*. São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 1996.

Virno, Paolo. *Ambivalencia de la multitud: entre la innovación y la negatividad*. Buenos Aires: Tinta Limón, 2011. https://ia600808.us.archive.org/22/items/2011AmbivalenciaDeLaMultitud/2011_ambivalencia-de-la-multitud_entre-la-innovacion-y-la-negatividad.pdf.

Virno, Paolo. *Gramática da Multidão: para uma análise das formas de vida contemporâneas*. São Paulo: Annablume, 2013.

Viveiros De Castro, Eduardo. *Metafísicas Canibais: elementos para uma antropologia pós-estrutural*. São Paulo: Cosac Naify, 2015.

Zukin, Sharon. "Gentrification: Culture and Capital in the Urban Core". Annual Review of Sociology 13 (1987): 129-147. http://www.lit.osaka-cu.ac.jp/user/yamataka/Zukin_1987.pdf.